### Report of Strategic Review Team

#### Executive Summary

The project for Promotion of Development and Confidence Building in the Chittagong Hill Tracts is being implemented in accordance with the project document signed in December 2005. The project began implementation in 2006 and is scheduled to end in September 2009. As the project enters its final year, the National Steering Committee meeting convened by MoCHTA decided that a Strategic Review he conducted to review progress to date and recommend strategic options in order for the project to meet its development objectives.

A team of two international and two national experts has reviewed the project strategy, structure, and implementation in October 2008. The team met with the Secretary of MoCHTA, Chairmen and senior staff of the CHT Regional Council, Chairmen of the Hill District Councils in Rangamati, Bandarban and Khagachari, Bohmong Circle Chief in Bandarban and the Deputy Commissioner in Khagrachari. The team also observed a mobile health clinic, a community school and community projects supported by the project. The team also did focus group discussions with a group of NGOs and Para Development Committees in two villages, and conducted individual interviews and a strategic review workshop with key project staff.

The strategy and structure was found to be appropriate for this complex multi-sectoral and multi-level project. However, it would be useful to distinguish between and organizationally respond to the cross-cutting core components (capacity building, community empowerment and confidence building) and the region wide components (health, education, and economic development). The additional implementation strategies of: multi-level multi-sectoral participatory planning, giving priority to remote communities, a partnership approach, and gender mainstreaming have all contributed significantly to the success of the project.

The major accomplishments of the project have been:

- Strengthening the capacity of local government institutions through their participation in planning and implementing this multi-sectoral development project.
- Empowering remote communities in 16 Upazilas by formation of 2177 Para Development Committees and 600 Para Women's Development Groups and providing micro-grants for community selected projects that are also supported by government technical services.
- Developing and implementing in six Upazilas a model for community-based health services in remote
  areas establishing six Mobile teams which serve 30 satellite clinics and supported a network of 250
  trained Community Health Service Workers to detect and treat malaria, TB, ARI and other
  communicable diseases and to provide maternal and child care.
- Extending education to remote communities in six Upazilas by supporting School Management Committees for school building or renovation, recruitment and training of 102 new teachers, and developing multilingual mother tongue education methods and materials.
- Strengthening the capacities of non-government organization and community organization partners and developing and supporting networks among them.
- Raising gender awareness and empowering women within communities and among government and NGO partners.
- Building the capacity of UNDP to support the project implementation creating a substantial UN field presence, and providing a platform for donor involvement and support to the people and institutions of the Chittagong Hill Tracts.

There is still much to do to meet the development objectives of the project to "support the Government of Bangladesh to enable the institutions and communities of the CHT to pursue accelerated and sustained socio-economic development based on principles of self-reliance and decentralized development to reduce poverty across the region".

Despite progress on community empowerment to reduce poverty and the innovative models to extend health and

D--

education services to remote communities, there is much more to be done. The extensive poverty, lack of public services in remote communities and continuing tensions in CHT still persist. Furthermore, there is a need to assure the sustainability of these initiatives by gradually integrating and transferring the project activities into the local government and NGO partners.

Therefore, it is recommended that the project be extended for four years and expanded to:

intensify capacity building in CHT institutions in order to integrate project activities and models into government or NGO partners and gradually transfer authority, resources and responsibility;

- extend the health and education services and models;
- 2. extend economic development and community empowerment components and increase emphasis on agriculture, food security and sustainable community-based forestry as mentioned in the project document; and
- 3. continue confidence building and facilitate forums for discussion on critical issues for development in CHT but also with indigenous communities outside the CHT.



#### Introduction:

The Promotion of Development and Confidence Building in the Chittagong Hill Tracts project started preparatory work in April 2003 but the current project document was not formally approved until December 2005 and is scheduled to continue until September 2009. The project is to "support the Government of Bangladesh to enable the institutions and communities of the CHT to pursue accelerated and sustained socioeconomic development based on principles of self-reliance and decentralized development to reduce poverty across the region". As the project enters its final year it is time to take stock of progress to date and to provide a rationale for further programme development. The National Steering Committee decided that a Strategic Review be conducted to review progress to date and recommend strategic options for the future in order for the project to meet its development objectives.

#### Methodology:

The Strategic Review Team had four members; Dr. Clarence Shubert, Team Leader; SY Khan Mojlish, former Member, Planning Commission; Dr. Manik Lal Dewan, former Chairman of the Rangamati Hill District Council, and David Joy, Programme Management Consultant.

Following a desk review of relevant documents related to the project, the situation in the CHT and development policies in Bangladesh, the team made three visits to the CHT Region. The team was able to meet with:

- Chairman and senior staff of the Regional Council;
- Chairmen and staff of Hill District Councils in Rangamati, Khagrachari and Bandaraban;
- Deputy Commissioner for Khagrachari District;
- Additional Superintendent of Police in Khagrachari; and
- Bohmong Circle Chief in Bandarban.

The team was also able to have a focus group discussion with six NGOs working on community empowerment education and economic development in Khagrachari. Members of the team also had individual discussions with senior managers and with the cluster leaders for Capacity Building, Community Empowerment, Education, Health and Economic Development. The team also organized and conducted an internal strategic review workshop with project management, cluster leaders and district coordinators. (A brief report of the workshop is attached.)

Field visits to observe project activities included:

- a mobile health team at Choto Harina Clinic in Barkal, Rangamati District;
- a community school in Rajastali, Rangamati District; and
- community projects supported by micro-grants and discussions with Para Development Committees and Women's Development Groups in villages in Bandarban and Khagrachari.

#### Overview of the Chittagong Hill Tracts:

The Chittagong Hill Tracts (CHT) located in South Eastern Bangladesh is divided into three districts: Khagrachari, Rangamati and Bandarban. The total area of the CHT is 13,295 square kilometers and the estimated population is 1.5 million. The region is geographically distinct from the central plains, with rugged mountainous terrain and, in many places, dense jungle. The rough terrains, remoteness of many villages and political issues associated with a protracted conflict have seriously impeded the economic development of the region. The majority of indigenous peoples continue to live in isolated communities and do Jhum cultivation. There is a high level of poverty, unemployment and illiteracy and an overall lack of economic opportunity. Because of their remoteness, the proper functioning of government social services is inhibited with serious consequences for the health and educational status of all inhabitants.

The CHT has undergone 25 years of conflict over the issues of local control of resources, land ownership and indigenous people's rights. The conflict was formally ended with the signing of a peace accord with the government by the Parbattya Chhattagram Jana Samhati Samity (PCJSS), the main insurgent group, on 2

December 1997. The CHT Peace Accord was recognized as a significant breakthrough and political achievement that raised high expectations, both within the CHT and across Bangladesh; that it would serve as the cornerstone of a successful peace building process and as a means for opening new opportunities for development.

The ethnic composition of the CIIT has changed dramatically in the last 50 years. According to the 1956 official census 91% of the population was of indigenous origin and 9% others. The steady change in this composition is shown in the 1991 official census which estimates that 51 % of the population is of indigenous origin. The indigenous peoples of CHT are represented by 11 or more ethnic groups, each of them having their own distinctive language, culture, and tradition. Ethno-linguistic diversity raises serious challenges to delivery of any sort of information, public services, or development assistance. It is also another source of political and social tension in the CHT.

Because of the steep and rugged terrain agricultural production is extremely difficult. Traditionally, the indigenous communities practice *Jhum* cultivation, a form of shifting slash-and-burn cultivation. *Jhum* is a form of subsistence farming although some cash crops are produced and sold in small quantities. A dependency on shifting cultivation for income, combined with shrinking land availability, results in an erosion of traditional livelihoods of the indigenous people and their ability to cope in crisis. It is now estimated that Jhum rotation cycle has been reduced from the traditional 15 years to only 4 or 5 years before land is reused with a consequent decline in fertility.

Communities are scattered in sparsely populated areas. Villages can be found in extremely remote and inaccessible locations, and in these locations transportation and communication are poor or non-existent. As a result, in the CHT, rural and predominantly indigenous communities are isolated and not served by many public services.

### The Peace Accord and Local Government Systems in CHT

The Government administrative system in the Chittagong Hill Tracts is different from other parts of Bangladesh. At present there are three different systems in the CHT: the central government's administrative system; the self rule government initially formed in the 1989 Hill District Council Act and revised in the Peace Accord of 1997; and the traditional administrative system of Circle Chiefs and Headmen.

The Chittagong Hill Tracts is divided into three administrative districts. The general administrative system of the central government in the CHT is represented by the Office of the Deputy Commissioner at the District Level and the local government bodies are the Regional Council, the Hill District Councils, the Upazila Parishad, Union Parishad and Pourasova. The Pourasova is the local government institution for municipalities. The Union Parishad is the lowest tier under the general administrative system and is responsible for a number of Paras or villages.

#### CHT Local Government System

As part of the Peace Accord in 1997 a decentralised Local Government system has been established, with responsibilities for the management of public services delegated to the Regional Council and three Hill District Councils. The Ministry of CHT Affairs (MoCHTA), which was also created as a result of the peace accord and headed by an indigenous Minister, is responsible for overseeing all activities in the CHT and recommends the staffing for the Regional Council and three Hill District Councils. The Hill District Councils recruit 3<sup>rd</sup> and 4<sup>th</sup> class employees of the transferred departments. Officers of the transferred departments are appointed by the concerned Ministry. All departmental staff report to departmental heads. The departmental heads report to the Hill District Council Chairman.

Bogn

As per the Hill District Council Acts of 1989 (as amended after the 1997 CHT Peace Accord), a total of 33 subjects are supposed to be transferred from the Ministries to the each of the three Hill District Councils. Of these, more than half have been transferred including health and education. However, some subjects of concern to this project such as forestry, land administration, and local police have not yet been transferred. The Hill District Councils may formulate and implement development plans on the subjects transferred to them but are largely dependent on funds provided by the central government and have limited capacity to raise their own revenue. In the transferred subjects, the concerned Ministries or Departments are to implement all development works undertaken by the Government through the Hill District Councils.

#### Traditional Governance System

Alongside the central government administrative system and Local Government systems, the CHT practices a traditional system based on customs and practices of the indigenous peoples. Although this traditional system has been in place for hundreds of years, the administrative areas in existence today, known as 'Circles' were not formally constituted until the CHT Regulation of 1900. There are three administrative Circles in the Chittagong Hill Tracts (Mong, Chakma and Bohmong) each with their own Chief or Raja. The administrative areas of the Mong, Chakma and Bohmong Chiefs broadly correspond to the decentralised Local Government administrative areas of Khagrachari, Rangamati and Bandarban Hill Districts. The Circle Chiefs are members of their relevant Hill District Council(s) and are engaged in other formal Governance networks.

Headmen are appointed by the Deputy Commissioners on recommendation from the Circle Chiefs and Karbaris are appointed by the Circle Chiefs. In rare instances where there are disputes, headmen may be selected by popular election. Headman (who may also be a woman) is the traditional leader of a Mouza – an area which constitutes several Paras (village) and Karbari is the leader of a Para (village). Headman and Karbari are considered 'learned persons' within the community with responsibilities for maintaining social law and order, revenue collection and land use registration of their communities.



#### Institutional Constraints:

Because there are overlapping government systems, particularly at the district level, there is some confusion on the roles and authorities among these systems. This is caused primarily by the fact that the Peace Accord is yet to be fully implemented.

Among the most important and empowering aspects of the Peace Accord was the agreement to hold elections for the Hill District Councils which would in turn elect a Regional Council. The HDCs were to be composed of 34 (33 members plus a Chairman) elected members proportionally representing the various indigenous groups but also having a proportion for long-time non-indigenous residents. Because there have been no elections, the HDCs, by law, can have only four members and a Chairman all appointed by the Government of Bangladesh on the recommendation of MoCHTA. Consequently, the HDCs are not fully empowered nor fully staffed local government bodies. Similarly, the Regional Council is limited in size and is selected by appointment rather than by election. Another problem is that only about half of the 33 subjects to be transferred to the HDCs has now been transferred. Among those not transferred are key areas such as forestry, land administration and police which are critically important in the CHT.

The issues surrounding land ownership, land rights and land use regulation are particularly complex and are in part the responsibility of all three of the government systems at the district level. Traditionally in the indigenous communities the land use and land rights were determined through the Circle Chief, Headman and Karbari system. This was based on the belief that land was communally owned and that the rights for farming, forestry and settlement would be distributed by consensus of the community as defined and interpreted by the Karbari and Headmen. Areas close to roads, water ways and towns have been gradually brought under the freehold system of land ownership established under British and subsequently Bangladesh laws. These different systems and perceptions of land ownership and right of use are a continuing source of tension and conflict within the CHT, particularly where there are new settlers from other parts of Bangladesh. The failure to fully activate the CHT Land Commission and the continuing ambiguity on who has authority to resolve land issues is a cause of tension and instability which impacts all development efforts in the CHT region.

Because of the continuing concern with security in the area, the government maintains control of travel and telecommunications in the CHT, particularly with regard to foreigners. These security controls hinder the project implementation by, for example, requiring prior permission and armed escorts for foreigners traveling outside the towns and main roads. This concern with security has also led to limits on telecommunications. UNDP has been allowed to set up one V-Sat radio communication with internet connections in Rangamai, but it is explicitly limited to their own use. Land line telephones and dial up internet connections are only available in the district towns. High speed internet access is very limited. Only recently have cell phone companies been allowed to operate in the CHT. It is anticipated that this will spread rapidly and will greatly improve communications in the area.

## Constraints due to the physical conditions of the CHT Region

The rough hilly terrain makes travel within the region difficult and many villages cannot be reached even by four wheel drive vehicles or by boat. This increases the travel time to reach remote villages and limits the amount of equipment and supplies that can be carried. The project has provided a generous number of vehicles including motorbikes and boats to project partners to overcome these constraints. However, the remoteness of many communities requires a full day of travel to get to a village and this means a three day mission for every training, monitoring or service provision activity. This has put a heavy cost in time and transportation on providing support to remote communities.

The settlement patterns of the indigenous people with scattered houses clustered loosely together further complicates the provision of services. A single cluster may have only 15 to 20 households and therefore community organizations are set up at the "para" or village level which combines several small clusters. Despite this loose settlement pattern the community empowerment effort has been able to effectively

Page .

organize Para Development Committees rapidly and effectively. This settlement pattern is also a factor in the decision to have mobile health teams to support satellite clinics until such time as more widely dispersed small clinics can be established.

The road network in the area is extremely limited and often in poor condition. There are numerous bridges that are often too narrow for two way traffic and are frequently closed for repair. Clearly this is one aspect of infrastructure development that needs attention, but is largely beyond the current capacities of the local government. Except for the main paved roads, most travel to villages requires four wheel drive vehicles, motor bikes or boats and some villages are accessible only by footpaths.

Much of the area of Rangamati district can only be reached by boat on the large lake and connecting rivers. The very large lake (the Kaptai Reservoir) was created by construction of a dam to provide hydro-electric power for the Chittagong region in the early 1960s which flooded much of the most fertile central valleys in the region. This was a traumatic event for the indigenous people because it submerged important towns and cultural heritage such as the palace of the Raja and temples as well as fertile fields. It led to large migration of people into neighboring countries as well as forced those who remained higher into the hills. However, on the positive side, this lake has become a major resource for fishing as well as an important means of transportation.

## Internal Constraints on the Project:

Over the course of the past three years there were several changes in project leadership and one gap of nearly a year without a project director. Although there were strong managers to guide day to day operations and continue to work on policy issues and coordination, the lack of a project director did make it difficult to deal with problems of organizational restructuring, initiating and facilitating high level policy dialogues, inter-agency coordination, donor relations, etc. Fortunately, that has now been resolved by appointment of a project director who is expected to stay for the duration of the project.

## The Role of UNDP in the CHT

UNDP has played a coordinating and facilitating role among donors and in the interactions among the GoB and CHT institutions regarding development in the region following the 1997 Peace Accord. In 1998 UNDP organized an International Conference on Peace and the Chittagong Hill Tracts and was also asked to field a needs assessment mission in CHT. There was a follow up joint GoB/donor Risk Assessment Mission in June 2002. That mission led to the development of a Preparatory Assistance project that started in 2003 and focused on small-scale community-based development. This project began in December 2005 based on that initial assistance and continues to focus on community empowerment but has also moved into capacity building, health and education services, and economic development. The direct execution of the project by UNDP has led to the establishment of a large field presence in three district offices.

### The Project Strategy and Structure

The overall strategy is to open new opportunities for development in the CHT through the promotion of selfreliant communities and the effective support of their development efforts by all concerned development institutions. The operational strategy includes five major components:

- 1. Capacity building of the CHT institutions to effectively plan and technically support the bottom up community
- Special region-wide initiatives that address cross-cutting development priorities and peace building opportunities;
- 3. Empowerment of Para communities for self-reliant development based on self-assessment of development opportunities, and management of small-scale activities supported by a Quick Impact Fund;
- 4. Confidence building discussion and activities among and between communities, CHT leaders from all communities, Government, and Donors, to address and seek practical alternative solutions to issues that have 85 impeded development;



Further strengthening of the UNDP capacities, especially at the field level, to coordinate, facilitate and support the above initiatives through a partnership approach.

This basic operational strategy was subsequently enhanced based on project experience to:

give priority to remote communities,

build partnerships particularly with NGOs,

use a multi-level and multi-sectoral participatory planning process and

increase emphasis on gender mainstreaming.

Observations on the Project Strategy and Structure

The core and cross-cutting components of the project are Capacity Building, Community Empowerment and Confidence Building. They are inter-linked, interdependent and provide the foundation for the rest of the project. While they each have specific discrete activities, they are also cross-cutting themes which underlie all of the work of the project. Both capacity building and confidence building are heavily influenced by the political environment and interdependent with implementation of the Peace Accord.

Region-wide development initiatives include Health, Education, Economic Development, and Gender Mainstreaming. Health and education are generally government services and are closely linked with the HDC and relevant line ministries. Economic development involves the private sector as well as the government. Gender mainstreaming affects all partners and communities.

Strengthening the UNDP capacity to support this project led to the creation of a substantial field presence with a strong team of national and international staff which has enabled the project to rapidly, flexibly and creatively respond to the unique situation in CHT within the operating procedures of the UNDP.

Giving priority for remote communities has had several positive effects. First, it gave a clear focus on the more needy and under served communities. Second, it helped to support the smaller indigenous groups. Finally, it required creative methods to adapt and support government service systems to enable them to be extended to these communities. On the other hand, this has increased the cost in terms of staff time and transportation.

Multi-sectoral and multi-level participatory planning and implementation was inherent in the nature of the project and was built into the structure through the Regional Coordination Committee, District Project Implementation and Facilitation Committees, Upazila Advisory and Support Committees and Union Facilitation Committees. NGOs also participate in these committees. Although this seems like a heavy management structure, it has been effective in assuring broad participation at all levels and is a major element in capacity building of local government.

Gender mainstreaming was not prominently mentioned in the project document, but has become a major part of the project strategy. In large part because of the effectiveness of the gender cluster, they have been able to influence all other components and all project partners including government, NGOs and communities.

A partnership approach in relations with government, NGOs and communities has built up trust and supported

transparency in how the project is managed and implemented and has resulted in an increased sense of ownership of project activities particularly among NGOs and communities. This has been particularly important in community empowerment where grant funds are owned and managed by the community on a long-term sustained basis.

## Summary of Achievements by Major Objectives

In a project of this magnitude and complexity it is difficult to quantify all the results. Many are intangible such as: increased trust among communities, improved relations between community leaders and government officials, more self-confidence among community leaders, and increased credibility of local government. However, there are outcomes that can be measured. Some are inputs such as training and equipment. Others are results such as schools built or children immunized. A few can be measured as impacts such as decline in rate of infectious diseases or increases in school participation rates, and increases in community resources. Following are some of the quantifiable achievements for each of the major project objectives.

#### Community empowerment:

Community empowerment is done by the organization and training of Para Development Committees (PDCs) and Womens Development Groups (PNDGs) by NGO community organizers and then providing direct grants to support community and women selected projects. Results can be measured in the organization of 2177 PDCs and 600 Para Womens Development Groups including the training of 10,705 PDC executives on project management; 13,012 trained for participatory monitoring; and 33,649 trained in consensus building decision making. It can also be measured by the establishment and regular monthly meetings of Union Facilitation Committees, Upazila Advisor and Support Committees, and by the numerous trainings and field visits of the NGO community organizers. Technical training of over 9,000 community members has also been done by the various line ministry officials at the Upazila level. It can also be measured by the establishment of bank accounts for every PDC and the release of about 2000 grants of Tk. 400,000 each for PDC selected and managed projects, and 150 grants of Tk. 200,000 each for women's projects for a total of Tk. 830 million already delivered directly to community accounts to support their projects. Most of these projects have been for the purchase of community assets such as cattle, fruit trees, agricultural machines, etc. that will carn a return on the investment and thereby add to the capital assets of the community. This has already enabled many communities to reinvest in social amenities such as sanitary latrines and water sources, rice banks or school buildings.

#### Capacity building of CHT institutions

Capacity building of CHT institutions has been primarily related to supporting the implementation of the project and can be seen in the establishment and effective functioning of a complex system of interlinked committees at regional, district, upazila and union levels to manage this multi-sectoral and multi-level development project. There have also been workshops for strategic visioning and long-term planning for the Regional Council and the three District Councils. Training for Regional Council and Hill District Council's staffs on management has been started by the Bangladesh Public Administrative Training Centre (BPATC). Training in English has also been provided to RC and HDC staff. Traditional leaders have received training on management and have also been given motor bikes and benefit from 10 multipurpose community centres provided by the project. Logistic support has also been provided to the RC and HDCs including a vehicle for each Chairman, motorbikes for staff, some boats, computers, printers, cameras and other office equipment.

### Confidence Building

Confidence building is a core component of the project that has discrete activities but it is also cross cutting in other components as well. International exposure visits were sponsored for senior officials to observe how other national governments work with indigenous groups in the Philippines, Malaysia, Indonesia, Guatemala and Canada. These observation visits are important learning experiences, but also build better relationships among

Boy

participants. The project has also sponsored 83 exchange visits with 1245 participants among communities in CHT. They are useful for comparing development projects, but equally important in understanding and appreciating cultural diversity. The project has also sponsored CHT cultural events to increase understanding of the diverse cultures in the region.

#### Region Wide Development Initiatives

Critical health services are being provided to remote communities through a new model based on 250 trained Community Health Service Workers, establishment of 30 satellite clinics supported by 6 mobile teams, each with a doctor, nurse and lab technician. The results of the health initiative can be measured in the 300,000 patients seen, the 31,594 malaria cases identified and treated, the 55 cases of TB identified and treated and the 3,251 children immunized. The impact is already being seen in the decline in the number of cases of malaria and TB reported in the first areas covered.

Education services in remote areas are provided by supporting School Management Committees (SMC) to provide school facilities, recruitment and training of new teachers through the HDCs, and development of multilingual education materials in local languages. So far 90 of the targeted 150 SMCs spread over 6 Upazilas have been selected and assistance for school repair/renovation has already been provided to half of them. So far 102 teachers have been recruited by HDCs and are being trained. Multilingual methods and materials for preschool and early primary level are being developed. Primary school participation rates are currently 67% in assisted communities and is expected to rise to over 80% by the end of the project.

The economic development component of the project has only recently begun. One of the first activities was to work with the International Centre for Integrated Mountain Development (ICIMOD) and arranging visits by experts from Thailand on indigenous handicraft development and marketing. There has been training of 18 women's weaving groups and training 56 participants on bee keeping. Another 2100 persons are identified to be trained in income generating activities. However, the main work in economic development will be based on feasibility studies of: non-timber forest products, bamboo and ratan, livestock, handicrafts, remote communication and information systems, sericulture, agro-based and small scale industries.

Gender Mainstreaming has been remarkably effective as indicated by the following accomplishments. Para Nari(women's) Development Groups (PNDG) have been formed in 600 communities and 150 have received grants to support women managed development projects. Grass roots women leaders networks have been formed in all three districts and brought together in the Chittagong Hill Tracts Women's Organization Network (CHTWON).

The major CHT institutions and local NGOs have received training on gender sensitization and many have developed their own gender policies. A programme to recruit, train and mentor young women professionals within the project has been developed.

### Strengthening of UNDP Capacities to Implement the Project

Project management structures have grown in response to demands. There are four offices: the head office in Dhaka, the main field office in Rangamati and district offices in Bandaraban and Kagrachari. There is a Project Director with a Chief for Programme and Policy in Dhaka and a Chief for Implementation and an Operations Manager in Rangamati. There are separate programme clusters for health, education, gender, and economic development in addition to community empowerment and capacity building.

Degr.

#### Capacity Building of CHT Institutions:

Capacity building by the Local Governance and Institutional Capacity Building cluster has been primarily focused on developing the mechanisms and capacities within the local government to support the projects community-based initiatives. As the project has moved into health and education services and more general economic development, there has been a corresponding increase in need to build the capacity of government counterparts. However, to strengthen the institutions in a fundamental way will be constrained until elections have been held and all subjects transferred to the HDCs.

Because the focus of this project is to support implementation of the Peace Accord, capacity building is appropriately being focused primarily on the Hill District Councils and the Regional Council although it also does provide limited support to MoCHTA, the traditional Circle Chiefs and headmen and lower levels of government in CHT as well. However, it has not addressed capacity building for the CHT Development Board which currently reports directly to MoCHTA. In principle, the CHT Development Board should play an important role in economic development.

The project has been able to assist the Regional and District Councils to support and implement the community based development and region wide development initiatives as called for in the project document including the establishment and regular functioning of the Regional Advisory Committee and the District Project Implementation and Facilitation Committees in each district. In addition, the Upazila Advisory and Technical Committees and the Union Facilitation Committees have been established and are functioning in the areas with project activities.

Most of the following specific capacity building outcomes envisioned in the project document have been addressed, although not yet in a comprehensive way.

- Workshops have helped the Regional Council and Hill District Councils formulate a vision and strategies for regional and district development.
- Preliminary self-assessment of their management systems have been done by the Regional Council and Hill District Councils, but these have not yet been followed up by in depth analysis of their capacity building requirements.
- Human resources directly related to project implementation have been strengthened through training and participation in planning and implementation, but training beyond that required for the project implementation has only recently begun.
- Logistic support (vehicles, motor bikes, computers and office equipment) has been provided to the RC, HDCs and Circle Chief offices.
- Traditional Headmen have been trained.
- Support has been provided for high speed internet access, local area networks and telephone exchanges but they have not yet been installed in all HDCs.
- Fifteen NGOs have been trained and provided motorbikes to support community-based planning and development, and several others for education and economic development.
- Support has been provided to compile and publish CHT bylaws and regulations.
- Institutional research and policy advocacy capacities are still limited in CHT institutions and have not
  yet received much support from the project.

The fundamental constraints on capacity development in CHT are the lack of an elected local government and the failure to transfer some subjects to the HDCs as specified in the peace accord. Until elections can be held and the full 34 member Hill District Councils are elected, whatever support that is provided will be only partially effective. Similarly, the Regional Council cannot have full power until it has been elected in turn by the elected members of the HDCs.

Some critical subjects such as forestry, land administration and police have not yet been transferred to the

Depu-

HDCs. This is critical to resolving issues related not only to forestry but also land rights for indigenous communities that live within forest reserves. The Land Commission for the settlement of land disputes has also not been fully operationalized, and this is a key mechanism for resolving much of the conflict between indigenous communities and new settlers. Police have been playing a very positive role through supporting community policing to resolve small problems that can lead to tensions among communities. If these subjects could be transferred it would help resolve many of the tensions in the CHT. Until there are local elections for the District Councils, the lines of authority of the Deputy Commissioner and the HDCs in matters of security, land, forestry and other non-transferred subjects will remain unclear.

It is anticipated that there will be nation-wide Upazila elections in the near future including in the CHT. Elected Chairmen of Upazila Councils will be important new figures in the governmental system. Upazila Chairmen will be important partners for the project and should replace the UNO as Chairmen of the Upazila Advisory Committee.

Despite the above political constraints that are beyond the scope of this project, it is possible to do much more in strengthening the HDCs and RC. However, this will require a more intimate knowledge of their current management systems and capacities. Although the project cluster for Local Governance and Institutional Capacity Building has laid out a set of activities and training, it needs to be made more relevant to the existing systems. Certainly there will be some areas related to introduction of a Management Information System (MIS) for record keeping, accounting and planning that will likely be beneficial. It may also be helpful to introduce a Geographic Information System (GIS) for planning and monitoring development work. Other areas that clearly need strengthening are human resources and the revenue raising capacity of the HDCs. However, what exactly is needed and how it would appropriately be introduced can only be determined by having experienced management consultants working inside these institutions.

The work of the project in community empowerment, health and education services are appropriately being planned and implemented with and through the District Councils and lower levels of the government. This helps increase the capacities of the HDCs in these fields and also helps identify what are the weaknesses and needs for improving health, education and other technical services being provided under the HDCs.

The Regional Council is concerned with overall regional development plans including economic development, environmental protection, socio-cultural issues, security and political developments. Along with MoCHTA, the Regional Council is an appropriate partner for the support to "Institutional Research, Policy and Advocacy Capacities" referred to in the project document. Among others this research and policy advocacy could focus on doing environmental and socio-cultural impact assessments. Initially this could focus on project activities, but then be extended to other major development activities of local government, national government or private business.

The Regional Council is also an appropriate location for economic development planning for the region as a whole. The Economic Development Cluster should select the consultants and review the feasibility studies in cooperation with the Regional Council staff working on these issues. This will both improve coordination with the local governments and also help strengthen the Regional Council capacity for regional economic planning.

#### Community Empowerment

Community empowerment was the initial strategy during the preparatory assistance and this has been gradually refined and expanded in this project. This is still the main core of the project and has been able to proceed without the political and institutional constraints that have affected capacity building and confidence building. The strategy of community organizing and guidance by trained and experienced NGOs combined with substantial grants to support community selected projects has been very effective.

The community empowerment component provides support for selected communities to organize Para Development Committees (PDCs), plan and manage their own development projects and manage the grant funds provided to support their projects. So far 2177 PDCs have been formed and about 2000 have received grants from the Quick Impact Fund. The funds are used to support whatever has been selected by the

Byo

community with livestock, agricultural equipment, fruit gardening, water and sanitation and rice banks being the most popular. The intention is that the projects will both improve conditions in the villages and also generate income for future development projects. This is a complex process that requires organizational, management, financial and technical training and advice. To provide this type of guidance and support, local government at all levels as well as NGO community organizers are mobilized.

There is a six step process: selection of areas, establishing partnerships with government agencies and NGOs, mobilizing and organizing communities, establishing community funds, ensuring women's participation, and participatory assessment.

1. Selection of areas is done by the District Project Facilitation Committee based on criteria such as: security, food security, vulnerability, service deficiencies and literacy rate. Specific communities are further selected by the Union Facilitation Committee based on criteria such as: lack of other development projects, high percentage of disadvantaged and marginalized families, particularly women headed households, and locations that are remote yet accessible.

2. Partnerships among government bodies and NGOs are developed through a set of committees: District Project Facilitation Committee, Upazila Advisory Committee, Upazila Support Teams, Union Facilitation Committee, and Para Development Committees. The committees bring together all those

that will be supporting the community empowerment process, including NGOs.

3. Mobilizing and organizing communities is done by trained NGO community facilitators. They meet with and organize women and youth as well as the men in the community. Communities are guided to form a Para Development Committee and trained to analyze the problems and resources of the community in order to reach an agreement on appropriate development projects. So far 10,705 PDC executives have been given management training, another 13,012 members were trained for participatory monitoring and 33,649 trained in consensus building. The individual PDCs also receive technical support from technical staff of the Upazila as well as the NGO organizers.

 Micro-grants are provided to establish a Community Fund. This fund (average Tk 400,000) is initially provided to support the particular projects identified by the community, but is intended to become a permanent source of capital in the community based on the income generated and, in some cases, supplemented by community savings. This requires further guidance to establish bank accounts and training on how to manage the community fund. So far 14,840 executive members of PDCs have been trained in finance management and basic book keeping and another 33,376 general members have been

trained to monitor the finances.

5. Ensuring womens participation is done both by requiring women members in the PDC (39% of the PDC members are women) and also in the committees reviewing proposals at the Union level, three members of the Union committee must be women. Many communities have also been organizing women's groups and supporting women selected projects with smaller grants as well. Gender awareness and leadership training for women is also provided to increase their capacity to participate in decision making and resource management.

6. Participatory assessments are done by community groups periodically to make decisions regarding the further development or shifting of priorities for their community's development projects. Many

communities have already made significant changes in the projects they have undertaken.

Another feature of the community empowerment programme is the encouragement of individual savings by members of the community. While these savings are deposited into a common community account, they are independently recorded in individual member pass books. The savings are accumulated from very small deposits (Tk 5 or 10) by both men and women, often associated with attendance at the PDC meetings. There is some concern that this may inhibit participation by the very poorest members of a community. The guideline from the project on how these funds should be managed is still being developed. Whether, for example, they can be withdrawn in case of an emergency or whether they entitle the saver to take out loans from the fund and if so at what interest rate. As the cumulative funds now exceed Tk. 10 million, it is important to establish how these funds will be managed.

It is also intended to have inter-community networks, described in a strategy document as follows.

"The PDCs will form their networks in the Unions and Upazilas. These networks will provide the necessary supports to the PDCs or communities and will bridge the gaps between the services provider/development actor and community people. These networks will not implement direct development projects and, therefore, they will not take any financial assistance for such purposes. However the networks will be joining in the

planning process of the government at Union and Upazila levels where they will help formulate area development plans."

These are ambitious roles for what are apparently non-funded, informal networks that have no formally defined functions. Further thought is needed about how these networks would be formed, what are their functions and what resources will be available for them to operate. Giving them a role in marketing and processing community products might help fund and empower the networks.

The community empowerment programme has now been implemented in 16 of the 25 Upazilas in the CHT. About 60% of the Paras in these Upazilas have been organized and have received grants. Although we did not have time to investigate the actual operations of PDCs and the community funds, we have observed that most of the communities have been able to use the funds well and have maintained and accumulated capital for continuing development. By June 2008 nearly 5,000 projects have been undertaken directly with the grants or with reinvested capital. The allocation by type of project is as follows: agriculture 906, livestock 1849, fish culture 360, agricultural machinery 844, water supply and sanitary latrines 371, power supply 67, transport 167, food security 213, small and cottage industries 88, education 75, forestry 9, and community centre 34.

Another initiative is the organization of 600 separate women's development groups in these communities. About 150 of these have been given smaller grants (Tk 200,000) specifically for women selected and managed The PDCs were too dominated by men so that a separate women's organization was needed to increase women's participation in community development. In one of the cases observed, women invested in a fruit tree nursery while the regular PDC bought cattle and then sold them to plant paddy fields and purchase land for fruit orchards. It was also noted that women persuaded another PDC to invest income from the projects in sanitary toilets. These may be indicative of the different preferences of the women's groups. It is intended that there will be a separate womens group in all of the communities assisted by the end of the current project.

The community empowerment programme is expanding as scheduled. However, it is noted that, even after that target for this project is met, there will still be nine more upazilas and 3000 more Paras remaining to be organized if the project can be extended and expanded.

#### Confidence Building

Confidence building as described in the project document is not so much a strategy as a collection of activities. In part the problem is that confidence is built up through a myriad of small actions by many different partners that are not under the control of a single manager. Nevertheless, there are specific actions that should be carried out by senior managers.

This is a core component of the project which has discrete activities but it is also cross cutting in that the activities of other components have a major impact on building confidence and trust among the institutions and communities within the CHT. This has been put directly under the Chief of Programme and Policy because it is an overarching and cross-cutting component that needs to be dealt with at the highest levels. The activities or outcomes noted under this component in the project document are handled directly by top management or are delegated to other clusters. Some of these activities have not yet been addressed because of political or other constraints. The project as a whole acts to build trust and confidence by, for example:

- helping extend government services for health, education and technical support to remote communities,
- enhancing the capacity and credibility of the Hill District Councils,
- supporting cultural and media events to raise awareness of diversity in CHT, and
- establishing a wide spread UN field presence in CHT.

The project has sponsored several international exposure visits for senior officials of MoCHTA, the Regional Council and the Hill District Councils to observe how other national governments work with indigenous groups. One visit observed the differences in relations with indigenous groups in the Philippines, Malaysia, and Indonesia. A second visit observed how the conflicts with indigenous peoples have been resolved in Guatemala and then went on to observe how the Canadian government has related to indigenous communities. A third visit was made to the Northern Philippines. This year a group is observing how Australia is working with its indigenous people. These observation visits are important not only as a learning experience, but also in building interpersonal relationships among the participating members. Building on these personal relationships the institutions that they represent can also build more trusting relationships,

Exchange visits among communities in CHT is another important confidence building measure that is carried out with the Community Empowerment component. So far the project has sponsored 83 exchange visits among different communities in the CHT with 1245 participants in these visits. Because of the isolation of many remote communities and the great cultural diversity of the region these exchange visits are particularly important. They are not only useful for learning from each other about development projects, but equally important in understanding and appreciating cultural diversities. Consideration should be given to expanding the visits outside of CHT.

Training and support for local police was mentioned in the project document but has not yet been taken up by the project. This is one subject that has not yet been transferred to the HDCs and therefore police may not be perceived as a CHT institution. However, there are good relations between the police and the local government and larger communities within CHT. The community policing programme is particularly effective in dealing with minor disputes and crimes. As it was described to the team, community leaders from the different communities in an area are invited to be members of a group to oversee community policing. This group is often able to defuse communal tensions and deal with minor crimes without resorting to formal police inquiries or court procedures. Working with and building on the community policing model could be an effective confidence building measure that should be taken up by the project, perhaps as part of the capacity building of CHT institutions.

In view of the fact that this project was initiated as a result of the UNDP role in facilitating discussions among government, CHT groups and the donor community, it is surprising that there has not been more emphasis on facilitating further National and Regional dialogues. It is important that issues related to implementation of the Peace Accord be addressed, particularly the transfer of subjects to the HDCs and the election of the HDCs. While it may be politically sensitive, a gradual approach of looking at transfer of individual subjects to HDCs might be addressed in forums sponsored by the project. The implementation of the Peace Accord is essential for strengthening local government in CHT and for achieving the goals of this project.

## Regional Development Initiatives:

Region wide initiatives so far include health and education programmes that have begun to operate in selected areas. More recently economic development activities have been started to address the marketing systems, private sector investment and youth employment that were specified in the project document. Environmental protection was also included under this heading in the project document, but it has not yet been addressed and should not be handled as a separate sector. Disaster preparedness, also included under this heading, is being addressed through the creation of a sub project but it has not become a separate component. In principle, region-wide initiatives should be planned, coordinated and monitored by the Regional Council although direct responsibility for implementation remains with the Hill District Councils. In particular, the HDCs are responsible for health, education and other local government services.

## Economic Development:

The outcomes related to economic development anticipated in the project document include:

- productive employment of youth,
- improvement of marketing systems and rural infrastructure for CHT products, and
- augmentation of private sector investment in CHT.

There was a large UNDP mission that elaborated these in 2005 but the proposals were too prescriptive and not sufficiently grounded in the context of the CHT. This was subsequently revised and elaborated by a short mission from the European Commission in 2007 that laid much of the ground work for the current approach to this component. However, the recruitment of a senior staff to lead the cluster was delayed so that the economic development component of the UN has only recently begun.

One of the first activities was inviting in groups working in mountain regions with indigenous peoples. The International Centre for Integrated Mountain Development (ICIMOD) from Nepal has set up an office in CHT and has developed partnerships with several local NGOs. The Thai Embassy also facilitated two visits by experts from Thailand that are experienced in indigenous handicraft development and marketing.

There has also been training of 18 women's weaving groups from all three districts done in cooperation with the HDCs. The project also carried out a training of trainers for 56 participants on bee keeping, and has identified another 2100 beneficiaries to be trained in various types of income generating activities. However, the main framework for economic development will be based on the results of feasibility studies in the areas of:

- non-timber forest products,
- bamboo and ratan,
- livestock. .
- handicrafts.
- remote communication and information systems
- agro-based and small scale industries.

A request for expressions of interest (EOI) in these areas has been issued. The advertised request for EOIs has elicited many responses which are currently being reviewed. In order to link economic development activities with the local government, it would be helpful to do the review in cooperation with the Regional Council.

The project also intends to set up District Business Development Centres which should be done in collaboration with the HDCs and the business communities in each of the districts. It is not clear how the project has been able to link up with the local business communities, but this is an opportunity for the project to engage more with this group.

It would also be good to involve those working on community empowerment. Many community projects supported by community grants have been in the areas under consideration in the feasibility studies and produce products that need to be more efficiently processed and marketed. The Community Empowerment cluster is currently organizing networks for mutual support among communities. This seems like an opportunity to work with them to give an economic function to those networks. For example, supporting them for fruit storage and marketing; dairy processing and marketing; or handicraft quality control and marketing.

Finally the project has initiated links between CHT and other groups in the Asia region through exposure visits in China, Thailand and Cambodia. The visit in Bangkok was to expose them to quality bench mark standards and the importance of branding and brand recognition. The visit in Cambodia was related to a Southeast Asia Trade Development initiative. It is intended that the CHT brand will be a basis for national and international marketing of products from the region. In order to achieve this brand recognition, there will need to be an extensive media campaign. The project should work with the MoCHTA and others to initiate and support such a campaign.

## Support to Basic Education in the CHT:

An in depth study was conducted from May to July 2006 by a UNDP Primary Education Mission in cooperation with the Directorate of Primary Education of the Ministry of Primary and Mass Education and supported by CARE, CIDA, Danida, Save the Children, SIL International, UNESCO and UNICEF. The project formulation was based on that study.

It was found that the current government and NGO educational activities still do not reach a substantial number of eligible children in CHT. A large number of children never enroll in school and among those that do there is a high drop out rate. This project intends to help the government ensure Education for All and achieve educational quality in line with the Millennium Development Goals and the national PEDP II. Another important feature of the project is multi-lingual mother tongue education for pre-schools and lower primary schools among indigenous groups.

The project objective is to support initiatives for better quality basic education for all by addressing issues of access, relevance, management and quality. The project has a special focus on indigenous children in unserved areas. Because of this focus there are a number of innovations required such as design and development of materials in indigenous languages, and adapting curriculum, text books and teaching materials to be more relevant to CHT. Therefore the project requires a pilot phase to work out these things and incorporate them into

the training of teachers and the management of schools. In addition, it is intended that communities play a larger role in supporting as well as over seeing education.

The pilot phase is nevertheless of a significant size. The target is to reach 150 schools in six upazilas. Two upazilas have been selected in each district and 25 schools will be selected in each of those upazilas. Of the twenty five schools to be selected, ideally ten will be new schools, 10 will be existing community or NGO schools and five will be registered non-government or government schools. So far 90 existing schools have been selected and it is expected that the remaining 60 new schools will be selected by early next year.

The role of School Management Committees (SMC) is very important. The SMCs have a responsibility to provide the school facility in their community, and receive support for this from the project. In the areas with active and assisted SMCs there has already been an increase in enrollment to 67% of eligible children in those communities. The project also is engaging the broader community through the Parent Teacher Associations (PTA) and Mother's Groups.

The project works through the HDCs primary education departments to select and train teachers. So far 102 teachers are being trained and it is expected that a total of 475 will be trained by March 2009. There will also be training of 150 head teachers in the new methods as they are developed. All teachers trained will be appointed and paid by the HDCs with project funds initially and eventually integrated into the regular education system. The HDCs will also monitor performance and evaluate the teachers.

There are currently seven language development committees meeting and working regularly to develop mother tongue multi-lingual education materials. Raising awareness on mother tongue education has begun in many communities and 60% of the schools in the pilot phase are interested to introduce multi-lingual education.

Although the project is still gearing up for full implementation of the pilot phase, it is expected that by the end of the current project in September 2009 all 150 schools will have been built or renovated, 475 trained teachers will be teaching, 150 head teachers will have been trained in the new methods and materials, and multi-lingual education materials will be available for those schools wishing to use it. It is estimated that there will be a need for new or improved schools in an additional 475 communities in the CHT if the project is extended and expanded which would require a total of 1500 trained teachers and 475 trained head teachers.

The education initiative is done in partnership with a number of organizations, and is organized and coordinated through committees at the Regional, HDC and Upazila levels. UNICEF is a major partner because of its work in establishing para centres that provide pre-primary education in many villages. The project is working with a highly regarded national teacher training institution to prepare and provide training for teachers. They are also working with another technical partner for multilingual education. NGOs will play an important role in organizing and planning with communities. One lead NGO has been selected in each district through competitive bidding.

#### Critical Health Interventions:

This component has been designed together with the Ministry of Chittagong Hill Tracts Affairs, the Ministry of Health and Family Welfare, Local Government and a number of relevant UN agencies (UNDP, UNFPA, WFP, UNICEF, WHO, UNAIDS) all of whom have contributed to this component's design.

The CHT health services are minimal and rarely go beyond the District and Upazilas headquarters. The MoHFW services are inhibited by the absence of health staff. The health staff has neither support nor incentives to extend their services to distant hard-to-reach villages. At the same time, the 1997 Peace Accord saw health become the responsibility of the Hill District Councils. In this context the challenge was how to define and implement creative strategies that will provide immediate priority health services to under-served and unserved populations while simultaneously working with the MoHFW and HDCs to find sustainable solutions.

The project has pilot projects for immediate health care in remote areas which will be implemented directly, whilst also working on capacity building in health management and improved health systems and infrastructure. Both strategies depend on the development of a network of community based services using community health



service workers, as recommended in the HNPSP, with linkages between them and formal health service providers.

The Hill District Councils, through the Civil Surgeons' offices and the offices of the Deputy Directors of Family Planning, supervise over 300 doctors and nurses, and over 800 community health workers. They are responsible for delivering health services across all Upazila in the CHT, and are responsible for over 235 health facilities, at District, Upazila, Union and community level.

The project established 15 Satellite Clinics across 3 Upazila. An additional 15 satellite clinics in 3 more Upazilas have recently been added. The clinic locations were agreed through consultations with stakeholders at Union, Upazila and District level, with the final decision in each District resting with the Hill District Council Chairman. The clinics are staffed by Mobile Teams on a rotational basis, one day per week, and receive on average 1,000 patients a month. In addition to running Satellite Clinics, the project, through the Hill District Councils, has recruited and trained over 250 women as Community Health Service Workers.

Each Community Health Service Worker is responsible for between 120 and 140 households in the village in which they reside and the surrounding area. They provide a basic package of health services including malaria testing and treatment, basic education, referrals etc, and are fully supported by Satellite Clinics. The pilot programme has proven effective in extending health services to communities in remote areas that do not have access to Government Services.

So far about 300,000 patients have been seen which has significantly reduced the morbidity and mortality due to malaria and other communicable diseases in those areas. Among these patients 31,594 were diagnosed with and treated for malaria and 55 had TB. Another 455 antenatal and postnatal patients have been seen and followed up by the CHSWs. Among these patients there were 3251 children who were vaccinated and 255 of them have been found to be malnourished.

UNICEF, through the Integrated Community Development Project (ICDP) has supported the Government in establishing a network of Para Centres in selected communities throughout the CHT. ICDP uses the Para Centre to offer a range of activities primarily early childhood development, but also awareness raising for health, water and sanitation.

UNFPA provides technical support to the Mother and Child Welfare Centres (MCWCs) in each District. At the community level, UNFPA is providing Skilled Birth Attendants training to Family Welfare Assistants (FWAs) and Health Assistants (HAs). With this training they are able to provide 'safe delivery' at home and are able to support and provide midwifery training to Family Welfare Volunteers (FWVs). UNFPA also supports family planning services to distribute contraceptives and provide counselling for long-term methods of contraception.

Given the multiple stakeholders and resources available, better coordination among the various agencies working in the CHT could substantially improve the coverage and quality of services being provided, maximising limited resources and consolidating benefits for CHT communities.

The transitional strategy for continuation of the health component is aimed at quickly up-scaling health services already piloted in CHT, so as to provide immediate health support to populations in remote areas. This will involve the expansion of CHSWs, up grading their skills, where possible to include that of skilled birth attendants, and linking them to satellite clinics through the use of mobile teams and backed up with ambulance services for emergency cases. The mobile teams consist of a medical doctor, nurse, pharmacist, laboratory technician, and health promoter. Satellite clinics will be established where there are no medical facilities in the remote areas of the CHT.

The long term strategy will support the GoB in its efforts to implement the Tribal Health Plan in the CHT. This involves the improvement of physical infrastructure of the existing health, nutrition and family planning facilities in the CHT, reviewing human resource policy development in the health sector, training all health providers working in the GoB health services. The health project is in accordance with the national health policy and priorities at all levels and especially with the Tribal Health Plan (THNPP) of MoHFW. This project is also in accordance with the spirit of the CHT Peace Accord of 1997.

Began

### Gender Mainstreaming

The projects approach to gender mainstreaming has been practical and action-oriented. It was based on a strategic analysis of the situation but with a degree of experimentation in implementation. It was seen as crosscutting and concerned with policy as well as practical action within the project components. The gender mainstreaming strategy is to lead to:

allocation of adequate resources for gender objectives,

gender equality objectives built into all strategy and policy documents,

- equal participation of men and women in setting priorities and programming,
- equality of opportunity as well as equality of outcome for women and men,
- gender equality at all levels and in all respects within the organization.

The gender mainstreaming effort within the project has been successful because it was perceived as crosscutting and working through all the other components of the project rather than developing a separate programme and set of activities. However, the separate development of women's groups and women managed projects does indicate that gender is still not fully mainstreamed even though it has been effective as indicated by the following accomplishments.

- Community based Para Nari(women's) Development Groups (PNDG) have been formed in 600 communities and 150 of them have already received grants to support women selected and managed development projects within their communities.
- Grass roots women leaders networks have been formed in all three districts and are now being brought together in the Chittagong Hill Tracts Women's Organization Network.
- The major CHT institutions (Regional and District Councils) and local NGOs have all received training on gender sensitization and many have developed gender policies.
- One hundred twenty project staff members are oriented on gender policies and training of new staff is
- A programme to recruit and provide training and mentoring of young women professionals within the project Technical Services has been developed.

The effectiveness of these activities on women's empowerment particularly at the community level will be studied by an independent consulting firm. This study should enable the project to assess the impact of their work and provide a guide for future action.

In many countries and communities the male dominated systems tend to reduce and undermine the contributions of women in the development process. By systematically empowering women, the gender mainstreaming effort of the project has contributed substantially to the effectiveness of the project and to broader development within the CHT.

## Strengthening of UNDP Capacities to Implement the Project

Project management structures have grown in response to demands. There are four offices: the head office in Dhaka, the main field office in Rangamati and district offices in Bandarban and Khagrachari. Recently 15 Upazila level coordination offices were added. There is a Project Director with a Chief for Programme and Policy in Dhaka and a Chief for Implementation and an Operations Manager in Rangamati. There is a need to consider some restructuring and reorganization to respond to the current and expected growth and complexity of the project.

The Chief for Programme and Policy in the Dhaka office handles policy coordination with MoCHTA and other national ministries, confidence building activities such as international exposure and exchange visits and discussions of sensitive issues, and protocol arrangements with the government and donors.

The recent creation of a Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation Unit in the Dhaka Office will improve the

project's capacity to assess results and eventually determine the impacts of project activities. A socio-economic survey of CHT was conducted early in 2008 and has just been published. This provides a base-line that can be used later to track changes in economic conditions and social indicators. This unit will also be able to support research and improve reporting.

The development of separate programme clusters for health, education, gender, economic development in addition to the community empowerment and capacity building clusters has added to the complexity of the project management. It is expected that a large expansion of work on agriculture, food security and forestry will be added in the near future. All of these clusters currently report to the Chief for Implementation in Rangamati along with three district offices. This is a large number of groups reporting to a single manager, and is being addressed in project restructuring.

The size of the staff, the fleet of vehicles, the large amount of procurement, logistics, and the financial arrangements directly transferring grants to thousands of community accounts has created a heavy burden on operations management. The operations group should be expanded and upgraded with further subdivisions as needed. For example, human resources management, with over 200 staff, should be a separate section.

Certainly the speed and quality of the project implementation would not have been possible in normal national execution, particularly by the recently created and not yet fully empowered District Councils. In the CHT with unique geographic features, ethnic diversity and a newly decentralized local government the national models and standards for government services need to be adapted. The direct execution has enabled the necessary flexibility and creativity to respond to the unique situation in CHT. However, the need to eventually integrate all of these activities with the local government makes it important to consider how they are structured and linked to the relevant government departments. In this regard, the use of the term cluster to designate technical units of the project is appropriate because it implies open, flexible and temporary structures.

The large number of project staff in the field and the many clearly marked that UN vehicles have a positive confidence building effect, but their maintenance may also be an issue for long-term sustainability when they are eventually transferred to the government.



## Justification for Extension and Expansion of the Project

The basic rationale for the project including poverty, lack of services and continuing tensions in CHT remain valid. The unique character of the hill tracts with rough inaccessible terrain, great cultural diversity and communal tensions that Justified the project also remain. Although there has been some progress particularly in community empowerment to alleviate poverty and in extending health and education services to remote communities, the pervasive poverty and large number of unserved communities requires a continuation and expansion of these programmes and services.

The project activities have mostly been carried out through the local government bodies or through local NGOs and community organizations. However, the financing and much of the planning and technical support personnel have been provided directly by the UNDP. In order to institutionalize the results of the project for long-term sustainability, there is a need to fully integrate project activities and models into local government and NGO partners.

There is a need for more intensive capacity building of local government institutions, particularly the Hill District Councils. In part, this should be through a gradual transfer of technical skills, equipment and financing from the project to the government and non government partners. Capacity building also means working with the Hill District Councils and line ministries to adjust policies and standards so that the project's innovative models can be incorporated into the local government systems. This can take place gradually over the suggested four year project extension.

There is a need to extend health and education services and expand to many more unserved and remote communities. So far these services using the new models for reaching remote communities are only serving some communities in six Upazilas. In order to reach most remote communities they will need to be expanded to all 22 rural Upazilas in the CHT, primarily through expansion of assistance through the HDC education and health services systems. This will require more support from the project and strengthening the capacities of the local government services systems.

Community empowerment should be expanded to the remaining 3,000 remote communities in CHT. In addition, the technical capacities of the community empowerment team needs to be improved to support agriculture and community-based forestry as envisioned in the project document. The individual savings in community funds is an important asset of communities and individuals, but it requires guidance from the community empowerment team. Finally, the development of inter-community networks has just been started and needs to be continued. Using these networks to promote economic development by, for example, developing them as marketing organizations for community products would be desirable.

Economic development activities on a region wide scale have just started and need to be further developed. Feasibility studies will determine the larger economic development effort. Also the networking initiated with International Centre for Integrated Mountain Development (ICIMOD), the handicraft marketing experts from Thailand and broader Southeast Asian marketing systems should be further developed. As noted above, the marketing of products produced by community initiated projects is an important area for the economic development component to pursue.

The exchange visits, international exposure trips and other aspects of the gradual confidence building supported by the project need to be consolidated by hosting forums for discussion of key issues of concern in CHT. The forums should be at a high level and involve those with a strategic interest in the CHT. Progress in implementing the Peace Accord is fundamental to the development and stability of the CHT, and capacity and confidence building within this project.

There is strong international donor interest and commitment for continuing support to the people and institutions of the Chittagong Hill Tracts. There are proposals for the European Commission to provide up to nine million euros for the continuation and expansion of the health interventions under this project and also fifteen million euros to support agriculture, food security and community forestry. The EC, other european partners, CIDA and UNDP are also expected to support the continuation and expansion of the project in the CHT. There are currently a number of proposals with donors that amount to about fifty million dollars that can be confirmed when the extension and expansion has been approved.



## Conclusion and Recommendation

As per the decision of the National Steering Committee convened by MoCHTA, a Strategic Review of the project was done by a team of senior international and national specialists in October 2008. The Strategic Review Team, on the basis of the above report, recommends the extension and expansion of the project for a further period of four years in order to:

- 1. intensify capacity building in CHT institutions in order to integrate project activities and models into government or NGO partners and gradually transfer authority, resources and responsibility;
- extend the health and education services and models;
- 3. extend economic development and community empowerment components and increase emphasis on agriculture, food security and sustainable community-based forestry as mentioned in the project document; and
- 4. continue confidence building and facilitate forums for discussion on critical issues for development in CHT but also with indigenous communities outside the CHT.



## Key Persons met by the Strategic Review Team

Mr. Shaikh Altafali, Secretary of the Ministry of Chittagong Hill Tracts Affairs

Mr.Mojibur Rahman, Deputy Secretary of MoCHTA for Development

Mr. Md. Abul Hossain, Joint Secretary of MoCHTA for Development

Mr. Md. Zakir Hossain, ERD

Mr. Jotyrindra Bodhipriya Larma, Chairman, Regional Council, CHT

Mr. Ushaton Talukder, Member, RC, CHT

Mr. Goutam Chakma, Member, RC, CHT

Mr. Jagatjoyti Chakma, Chairman, Hill District Council, Rangamati District

Mr. Thanjama Lushai, Chairman, HDC, Bandarban

Mr. Manindra Lal Tripura, Chairman, HDC Khagrachari

Mr. Aung Shwe Prue, Chief, Maung Circle, Bandaraban

Mr. Md. A. K. M. Khairul Alam, Deputy Commissioner, Khagrachari

Mr. Md. Osman Goni, Additional Superintendent of Police, Khagrachari

Dr. Stefan Frowein, Ambassador of the European Commission to Bangladesh

Mr. Milko van Gool, Head of Operations, European Commission

Mr. Fabrizio Senesi, Programme Manager, European Commission

### Key Project Personnel Interviewed

Patrick Sweeting, Project Director

Robert Stoleman, Chief Implementation

Prasenjit Chakma, Chief Policy and Confidence Building

Lushantha Arsecularatne, Operations Manager

Lee R. Briggs, Head, Planning, Monitoring and Reporting

Biplab Chakma, Leader, Community Empowerment Cluster

Shibrash Pokral, Leader, Capacity Building and Local Government Cluster

Dr. Rabiul Alam, Leader, Health Cluster

Deg-

Shwe Aung Prue, Leader, Education Cluster Jhuma Dewan, Leader, Gender Mainstreaming Lysanna Howard, District Coordinator, Khagracheri District Churna Chaudhari, District Coordinator, Bandaraban District

### Groups Met

- Focus group discussion with NGOs working on community empowerment in Khagrachari.
- Strategic review workshop with senior management, cluster leaders and district coordinators.

  Discussions with Para Development Committees and Women's Development Groups in two villages of Bandarban and Khagrachari Districts.

## Field visits to observe project activities:

- a mobile health team at Choto Harina Clinic in Barkal, Rangamati District,
- a community school in Rajastali, Rangamati District, and
- community projects supported by micro-grants in two villages



## Strategic Review Workshop

Rangamati 29 September 2008

Participants included the Senior Management Team, Cluster Leaders, District Coordinators and the Strategic Review Team. Participants were grouped into three working groups:

- Group I Local government capacity building, gender, education and health
- Group II Community Empowerment and Economic Development
- Group III Confidence Building and Overall Project management

Each group was asked to respond to six general questions. The questions and their responses are shown in the attached table for ease of comparison. After the groups reported back, a plenary discussion focused on drawing out commonalities in terms major contributions of the project, strategies and the reasons for their successful results.

## Major Accomplishments:

- Most important has been the empowerment of communities through formation of Para Development Committees, direct grants to support community initiated projects and the linkage of remote communities to government technical services.
- Local government has been involved and strengthened at all levels through the effective implementation of the project and delivery of services.
- Gender awareness and empowerment among all the partners (government, communities and NGOs)
- A unique model for delivery of health services was developed that provides trained community health has been particularly successful. services workers (CHSW) supported by mobile clinics with a doctor and lab services for detection and treatment of malaria, TB and other critical diseases.
- Education services are extended to remote communities by formation of School Management Committees to manage and improved school facilities, training and provision of teachers, and development of a method for mult-lingual education in local languages.

## Reasons for Success:

- Direct execution enabled rapid responses that can be more flexible and creative to unique local situations. This has been particularly important to support the implementation of the peace accord and to respond to the unique governance systems, geography and socio-cultural environment of CHT.
- The participatory multi-level, multi-sectoral planning and implementation process that involved and mobilized many organizations and institutions.
- The partnership model for cooperation among government, NGOs and communities helped assure
- mutual trust, transparency and ownership. Giving priority to remote areas and communities helped to empower the most deprived, under served, minority groups and enabled unique systems to extend government services to those groups.
- The large scale of the project was itself a major contributing factor because it: established a major field presence of the UN, enabled mobilization and partnerships among government and NGO partners, and increased credibility of all the partners with local communities.

## Issues of Concern for Sustainability and Institutionalization:

- How will salary differences between the project and the government be harmonized?
- Have we given sufficient attention to sustainability and eventual institutionalization?
- Have we analyzed potentially negative socio-cultural, environmental and political impacts?
- Can we increase mediating to resolve conflicts that impede the peace accord?

### List of Documents Reviewed

United Nations, United Nations Development Assistance Framework in Bangladesh 2006-2010, March 2005

United Nations, Guidelines on Indigenous Peoples Issues, February 2008

United Nations, Common Country Assessment of Bangladesh, January 2005

UNDP, Country Programme for Bangladesh 2006-2010, September 2006

UNDP and Ministry of Chittagong Hill Tracts Affairs, Project Document: Promotion of Development and Confidence-Building in the Chittagong Hill Tracts, Signed on 15 December, 2005

Ministry of Chittagong Hill Tracts Affairs, Technical Assistance Project Proposal on Promotion of Development and Confidence-Building in the Chittagong Hill Tracts, 30 August 2004

UNDP, Annual Report 2006, Promotion of Development and Confidence Building in the Chittagong Hill Tracts (BGD/02/006)

UNDP, Annual Report 2007, Promotion of Development and Confidence Building in the Chittagong Hill Tracts (BGD/02/006)

"The Rangamati Declaration of 1998", Conference on Development in the Chittagong Hill Tracts, Rangamati, 18-19 December 1998

## The Chittagong Hill Tracts Peace Accord of 1997

UNDP-UNICEF-WFP, Joint Agency Assessment Report on Food Security Crisis Caused by Rodent Infestation in the CHT of Bangladesh", Draft of May 13, 2008

Prasenjit Chakma, "Bangladesh Country Report", Asia Workshop for the Promotion of the UN Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples, June 8-11, 2008, Baguio, The Philippines

European Commission, "Review and Elaboration of Economic Opportunities Formulation Component of the CHTDF Project, Bangladesh" April 2007

UNDP, "Economic Opportunities in the Chittagong Hill Tracts: Part II - Project Components", December 2005

"Key issues in relation to the exercise of the collective rights of IPs", author unknown

WFP, "Nutritional Status in the CHT: Executive Summary" July 2008

Shapan Adnan, "Paradoxical Aspects of Poverty and Development: the Case of Ethnic Minority Groups in the Chittagong Hill Tracts of Bangladesh", Presented at Sixth ASEAN Inter-University Seminar on Social Development, University Sains Malaysia, Penang, 14-16 July 2004

Human Development Research Centre, Socio-Economic Baseline Survey of the Chittagong Hill Tracts, prepared for UNDP Dhaka, September 2008

Ministry of Chittagong Hill Tracts Affairs, website, "Rangamati Hill District Council"

## The following internal documents of the Project were reviewed:

"Confidence Building Initiatives in the CHT: A Policy Document", February 2007

"Empowering the CHT Poor Communities: Strategy Paper", February 2008

"Moving from Policy to Practice: A Good Practice Guide to Gender Mainstreaming", February2008

"Support to Basic Education in the Chittagong Hill Tracts: Implementation Strategy and Guideline", February2008

Ag\_

- "Local Governance and Institutional Capacity Building: Strategy Paper", 2008
- "Policy document, Strategy and Implementation Plan, Health Cluster"
- "Technical Annual Work Plan 2008"
- "Revised Organizational Structure", 2/7/2008
- "Interim Report to European Commission", February 2008
- Power-Point Presentation: CHT: Looking Ahead, May 12, 2008
- "Approved Budget Revision", 26 May 2008
- "Performance Monitoring Framework", May 2007
- "Strategic Planning and Organizational Assessment Workshop Reports" Regional Council and Hill District Councils in Bandarban, Khagrachari and Rangamati, in August 2007
- Dr. Manik Lal Dewan, "Jum (Swidden Cultivation)", briefing note, October 2008
- Dr. Manik Lal Dewan, "Institutional Capacity Building", briefing note, September 2008



## Subjects Already Transferred to the Hill District Councils

(As of October 2008)

- Agricultural Extension

- Health
   Family Planning
   Primary Education
- 5. District Cooperatives
- 6. Bazar Fund
- Bangladesh Small Cottage Industry Corporation
   Social Welfare
- 9. Fisheries Department
- 10. Livestock Office including poultry, duck and pig farms
- 11. Public Health Engineering
- 12. District Sports
- 13. Tribal Cultural Institute
- 14. District Cultural Academy
- 15. Public Library
- 16. Youth Development Office
- 17. Textile Vocational Institute
- 18. Horticulture
- 19. Cotton Development Board
- 20. Family Welfare Volunteer Training Institute

## Subjects Not Yet Transferred to Hill District Councils

- Land Administration
- 2. Local Police
- Forestry
- Roads and Highways
   Nursing Institute
- Teacher's Training Centre
- 7. Secondary Education
- Parjatan
   Fishery Research Institute
- 10. Agriculture Research Institute
- 11. Bangladesh Fish Development Corporation
- 12. Bangladesh Agricultural Development Corporation
- 13. Education Engineering Department

## Summary of Achievements & Future Targets as per RTPP

## Capacity Development:

Achievement up to November 2008		Future Target/January 2009-Sep 2013	
•	4 Strategic Workshop organized and developed CHT development vision.	Organize Strategic Planning Workshop.     Organize Sectoral Planning Workshop.     Develop long term development strategy.	ian
	Participatory Supervision and Monitoring Guideline (Draft) developed.	Improve Institution's internal organizat and management, establish and operationalize units per recommendation OD study, develop procedures and guidelines.  Improve institutions working process, implement capacity development strate.  Introduce and implement participatory monitoring system.  Improve Financial Management system.  Conduct internal and external audit.  Increase Internal Revenue & later improplanning of internal revenue.  Improve contracting and tendering.	gy.
	Training organized for 1st Class officers of CHT institutions on Modern Office Management at BPATC.  Training organized for 2nd Class officers of CHT institutions on Basic Office Management at RPATC.  Training organized for 1st Class officers of CHT institutions on Human Resource Management at BPATC.  Training organized for 2nd Class officers of CHT institutions on Modern Office Management at RPATC.  Training organized for 3nd Class officers of CHT institutions on Modern Office Management at RPATC.  Training organized for 3nd Class officers of CHT institutions on File and Record Management at RPATC	<ul> <li>Develop 20 training modules in the contex CHT.</li> <li>Organize training for 300 staff of CHT institutions based on the developed traini modules.</li> </ul>	



<ul> <li>English Language Course for RHDC policy makers and staff.</li> <li>English Language Course for RC staff.</li> </ul>	
<ul> <li>Vehicles, computers, printers, scanners, cameras, photocopiers etc were provided to RC, HDCs and Circles.</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Logistics and technical support to Institutions.</li> <li>Provide CHT Land Commission, IDP Task Force and Judiciary with technical, advisory, training of staff and logistical support.</li> </ul>
<ul> <li>Guideline prepared for District Periodic Plan (Draft).</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Introduce Participatory Planning process, prepare Annual Development Plan, and institutionalize participatory planning process.</li> <li>Develop Sectoral and District Periodic Plan; link Periodic Plan with Sectoral, Area and Annual Development Plan.</li> <li>Institutionalize Gender Mainstreaming in Participatory Planning Process.</li> </ul>
LAN and PABX system installed in RC.     LAN and PABX system installed in KHDC.	Establish Information Resource Centre & ensure it is effective functioning. Set up and train staff on GIS and use in planning & monitoring.  Introduce Transparent Mechanism, set up public hearing and audit.  Produce Resource and Poverty Maps.
Training Module developed for the traditional and elected leaders.  1180 traditional and elected leaders were trained on their roles and responsibilities	Enhance Capacity Building of NGOs     Develop Model Mouza/ Area development plan     Implement Mouza Plans
Developing of Rule and Regulations as per Regional Council Act 1998.     Compilation of CHT related laws.	Establish Horizontal and Vertical Linkages     Enhance Advocacy capacity     Conduct Gender Budget Audit



## 2. Economic Development:

Achievement up to November 2008	Future Target/January 2009-Sep 2013	
<ul> <li>Primary evaluation of EOIs for scoping study on- Bamboo &amp; Rattan, NTFPs, Forestry, MSME, Handicraft, Communication system.</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Income generation opportunities increased and diversified</li> <li>Training and support in added value activities</li> <li>Training and support in cash-crop agriculture</li> <li>Linkage (MOU) with buyers / agents</li> <li>Market chain development</li> <li>Skills development to enhance employment opportunities (market oriented)</li> <li>Internship / apprenticeship program</li> <li>Technical support</li> </ul>	
<ul> <li>LoA signed between HDC in 3 Hill Districts for weaver groups training.</li> <li>Orientation of ICIMOD activities in 3 districts was organised.</li> </ul>	Training for community people, especially for youth on sericulture,	
<ul> <li>Workshop and exchange visit organized on NTFP.</li> <li>Organized 2 workshops-one with weaver groups and the other with different stakeholders.</li> </ul>	CHT brand and quality benchmarks created     Capacity building to the committee     Advocacy for recognition of the brand     Market promotion activities	

<ul> <li>Organized ToT on Bee keeping for 20 persons and already completed 2 batch training at household level.</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Development of benchmark and standard.</li> </ul>
3 Feasibility & scoping studies have been conducted on Ginger, Medicinal & Aromatic Plant and Mushroom.	
<ul> <li>Organized 1 batch entrepreneurship training for 15 PNGO staff.</li> </ul>	
<ul> <li>Provided yarn support to 18 selected weaver groups and facilitated their participation with different products in cultural festival.</li> </ul>	
<ul> <li>Support provided to 5 representatives of different institutes involved with crafts and CHT policy for participation in the workshop on UNESCO SEAL held in Thailand.</li> </ul>	
<ul> <li>Organised exchange visit for 4     Representatives of different     stakeholders in China.</li> </ul>	
<ul> <li>Developed concept on Business</li> <li>Development Centre.</li> </ul>	
<ul> <li>Organised exchange visit for 14     representatives of different institutions     of CHT including CHT Ministry on     Ginger processing and value addition.</li> </ul>	
dinger processing and	Cultural industry development     Bamboo & rattan handicraft (products)     NTFPs (non-timber forest product)     Products marketing.
	5. Building Economic institutional capacity (chamber, bazar fund, HDC and line department)
	Equipment and Logistics support     Market information system     development     Market infrastructure development.     Construction/ renovations of     150 markets/ commodity     collection centres/ growth     centre.
	Training and exposure visit     Private Sector Development in CHT

<ul> <li>Capacity building</li> <li>Advocacy &amp; lobbing.</li> </ul>
7. Eco Tourism development in CHT  Motivation and capacity building Linkages and coordination Motivation and capacity building Linkages and coordination Infrastructure development.
B. Monitoring and documentation     Learning documentation     Monitoring and evaluation.
9. Support of implementation of the project  Personnel Advisor -1, Cluster Leader - 1, Program Officer - 1, Expert - 6, Supervisor - 6, Associate - 1, Assistant - 2 Office equipment Transport and logistics Staff development Implementing partners.

## 3. Health Development Programs:

	Achievement up to November 2008	Future Targ	et/Jan 2009-Sep 2013
	Total health intervention by UNDP in 6 Upazillas.	Upazillas in Ch	m be implemented to 22 HT.
	310,000 cases have been treated.	3,000,000 cas	es will be treated.
	12000 pregnant mothers have been provided anti-natal and post-natal care.	care by the m	nt mother will be provided obile clinic and CHSWs.
	Significant increase in immunization coverage in intervention Upazilla.	Immunization from the curr	coverage will up to 10% ent coverage.
_	35,100 malaria cases have been treated.	200,000 mala	ria patients will be treated.
•	2000 malnourished child has been screened for treated.	screened for	urished children will be treatment.
	4 Special supports have been provided to the National campaign/ health activity.	different nati	pports will be provided to onal health activity.
	De-worming 3000 child completed.	10000 childre worming tabl	en will be provided to de- let.
•	Reduce the morbidity and mortality from communicable diseases including malaria	Reduce the m	norbidity and mortality from le diseases including malaria

tuberculosis and HIV/AIDS.  Significant achievements  (No mortality due to malaria and pregnant related complications).		tuberculosis and HIV/AIDS.  Significant achievements (No mortality due to malaria and pregnant related complications) and to reach the MDGs goal and target.	
•	272 Community Health Service Workers (CHSWs) have been trained and they provided health services in their communities.	1500 CHSWs will be trained in 22 upazilla.	
	7 Mobile Clinics is providing health service and technical support to the CHSWs.	<ul> <li>23 Mobile Clinics will provide health service and technical support to 22 Upazillas.</li> </ul>	
	Integration of GoB health and FP program with Mobile Clinics and CHSWs: 6	<ul> <li>Integration of GoB health and FP program with Mobile Clinics and CHSWs: 22 Upazillas.</li> </ul>	
	Upazillas.	<ul> <li>Construction/renovation/equipping of 100 health infrastructures facilities on need based assessment report</li> </ul>	

## 4. Education Development Programs:

Achievement up to November 2008	Future Target/January 2009-Sep 2013	
<ul> <li>Renovation of 72 schools (predominantly community owned).</li> <li>Developing a design for 2 classroom blocks.</li> <li>It is also intended to construct 60, 2 block classrooms by the end of Phase I to serve new communities currently with no educational provision.</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>300 schools constructed/ renovated with four rooms and with all necessary facilities. Project will also follow existing PEDP-II policy and guidelines in this regard.</li> <li>300 SMCs meeting regularly and taking decisions.</li> <li>80% Para people with increased awareness on the importance of education.</li> <li>80% increased enrolment in para covered by existing and new schools.</li> <li>80% increase in para people I involvement in SMC, PTA and mothers' group.</li> </ul>	
<ul> <li>Technical Specialist NGO identified for Teacher Training: DAM</li> <li>Teacher training needs assessment conducted by DAM</li> <li>Trainer training workshops conducted</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Exposure visits or study tour organised and 500 persons gained experience.</li> <li>One technical partner for teacher training recruited and supported activities.</li> </ul>	



by DAM  Implementing Partner NGOs trained at District level in Teacher training: 2 completed, 3 scheduled by end of Phase I.  Teachers have received training: 25 teachers in 5 separate workshops.	<ul> <li>The Program planned, reviewed and coordinated regularly.</li> <li>300 SMCs received funds and school facilities improved.</li> </ul>
<ul> <li>Technical Specialist NGO identified for MLE: SC (UK) and SIL (International Indigenous Language Specialists).</li> <li>7 representative indigenous Language Committees (LCs) established.</li> <li>IPNGO trainings conducted in MLE by SIL.</li> <li>Teacher training guidelines developed in indigenous languages.</li> <li>Pre-primary curriculum in development in indigenous languages (PP – L1; Grade V: 90% Bangla, 10% L1) – PP will be finished by end of Phase I. (see Appendix 3 for sample MLE materials developed).</li> </ul>	
Sharing sessions with key stakeholders held for unique education need of CHT	<ul> <li>Workshop organized -12 at district level, 4 at regional level and 2 at national level and awareness increased on education and MLE.</li> <li>Three (3) study or exposure visits outside CHT organized and 60 persons gained experience.</li> <li>Advocacy workshops/ 3 district, 2 regional and 3 national levels organized and increased support for the programme.</li> <li>15 education forums established at upazila and district levels and supported education programme.</li> <li>Forum meetings/ 192 at upazila and 24 at district levels organized and initiated action plans.</li> </ul>
No programme in present phase	<ul> <li>Survey in 6 Upazillas completed.</li> <li>Materials for adult literacy programmes available.</li> <li>300 schools for adult literacy running.</li> </ul>



## 5. Community Empowerment:

Achievement up to November 2008	Future Target/January 2009-Sep 2013	
<ul> <li>2177 PDCs formed and supported with QIF grants.</li> <li>600 Para Nari Development Groups formed and supported with Women Managed Projects (WMP)</li> <li>About 45,000 community people trained by partner NGOs.</li> <li>About 20,000 Women trained by partner NGOs.</li> <li>About 24,000 People trained by Govt. line department.</li> <li>28 National UN volunteers trained.</li> <li>300 NGO staffs trained on PRA, gender, facilitation, PDC formation, financial management, entrepreneurship etc.</li> <li>118 Exchange Visits organised.</li> <li>19 Partner NGOs supported (presently 15 working).</li> <li>3 District Project Facilitation Committees (DPFCs) formed and regular meetings were organised.</li> <li>16 Upazila Advisory Committees (UzAC) formed and regular meetings were organised.</li> <li>16 Upazila Support Teams (UzST) formed and regular meetings were organised.</li> <li>75 Union Facilitation Committee (UnFC) formed and regular meetings were organized</li> <li>7000 rat-flood affected families supported with assistance (food grains and seeds).</li> </ul>	2000 communities provided with agriculture support.     9 UzAC formed.     9 UzST formed.     37 UnFC formed.     45 Gender sensitization workshops organized for UnFC & UzAC.	

## 6. Confidence Building:

Achievement up to November 2008	Future Target/January 2009-Sep 2013
Confidence Building Unit established —	Organize national and local level dialogues with key stakeholders on



- national programme officer recruited.
- Confidence Building and Development Advisor recruited – arrival shortly.
- CHT Trust and Confidence Building Initiative' Component Document finalized and granted funding from UNDP Bureau of Crisis Prevention and Recovery (BCPR) for the first year: \$563,000.
- Provided training in ecologically based integrated rodent past management to more than 2000 local leaders and government officials.
- Commissioned a comprehensive scientific study on bamboo flowering and rodent ecology in the CHT.
- Provided emergency food aid to 7000 severely rodent affected families.
- Produced a documentary film focused on a group of student volunteers from Dhaka University who travelled to constructed school in a remote village.
- Commissioned a study on nutritional health and food security emphasizing women and children in rodent affected communities.
- Organized five study tours on post conflict experiences. First one in Philippines, Indonesia (Kalimatan) & Malaysia (Sabah-Sarawak), second one in Guatemala, and Canada, Third in the Philippines, fourth and fifth in Australia. Around 100 people (CHT leaders, govt. officials, members of parliament and civil society) participated in the study tour.
- Organized debriefing sessions on the learning of study tours.
- Finalized component document on 'Minority Rights and Cultural Diversity'.
- Linkages established with local government institutions in CHT.
- Preparation underway for key stakeholder dialogues series on

- CHT issues.
- An event to promote women as Peace Makers.
- Develop community outreach and advocacy strategy.
- Develop advocacy and campaigning guidelines.
- Planning of community outreach and advocacy activities.
- Establish CHT stakeholder network and organize quarterly meetings.
- Establish National stakeholder network and organize bi-annual meetings.
- Establish CHT women network and organize quarterly meetings.
- Preparation of Concept Notes on critical issues in advance of National Dialogue Event.
- National Dialogue Event among the networks on critical issues.
- Regular publication of Newsletter.
- Regular e-news bulletins.
- Special publications.
- Organize international study tours with key stakeholders to countries with similar post-conflict experience and/or decentralized governance.
- Support the organization of a study tour and follow up lessons learnt and learning applied.
- Organize exchange visits to and from the CHT for the purposes of confidence building.
- Organize exchange visits within CHT and to and from the CHT (4).
- Gathering of Best Practices in Bangladesh or abroad related to conflict resolution, confidence building and development.
- Develop Knowledge Management Strategy.
- Develop Knowledge Management Guidelines.
- Planning of Knowledge Management Activities.
- Collect and disseminate best practice

different important issues e.g.

- CHT Jhum Cultivation, sustainable livelihoods and alternatives.
- Overseeing development programmes in CHT: rules of CHT Institutions.
- Customary Rights and Practices of the indigenous people of CHT.
- The management system of Local Resource and Indigenous Knowledge: CHT perspective.
- Reflection of Indigenous peoples' culture in the school education curricula and children's attitudes on Indigenous peoples.
- Organize other dialogues related to implementation of the Peace Accord:
- Access to Justice for Indigenous People in Bangladesh.
- Rehabilitation of Returned Refugees, Internally Displaced People and Ex-Combatant.
- Means of free, fair and participatory elections in CHT: voter list and effective electoral rules, procedures and systems.
- Effective Land Management in CHT: strengthening CHT Land Commission and Land Dispute Resolution.
- CHT Peace accord: challenges of implementations and ways forward.
- Human rights and social security of the indigenous people in Bangladesh.
- Prepared concept notes on resource mobilization and land issues.
- Preliminary consultations with MoCHTA and key stakeholders for the Dialogue.
- Formed Management Committees of the Multi Purpose Community Centre (MPCC) and handed over these centres

- information among clusters through the establishment of regular information sharing meetings.
- Publication of CHT Best Practices (case studies, lessons learnt etc).
- Sharing of Best Practices from elsewhere in Bangladesh and abroad through desk based reviews, study tours, exchange visits and dialogue.
- Land Dispute Resolution support plan and budget to be developed in close cooperation with Ministry of Land, MoCHTA and RC.
- Study on Natural Resource
   Management in the CHT to be carried out at various times throughout the year.
- Study on Natural Resource
   Management in the CHT to be carried out at various times throughout the year.
- Training programme for Police Force in CHT with special focus on modern policing and investigative techniques and police management.
- CHT Police Force Logistics and Support.
- Technical and logistic support in organizing and conducting the HDC elections.
- Special Electoral database for the CHT.
- Organize national and international cultural festivals and events.
- Development of indigenous Knowledge Products (including culture & customs).
- Publication and dissemination of knowledge products to promote minority interests and cultural diversity—launches linked to cultural events, observation of special days: New Year Festival, Indigenous People's Day, and Cultural Festival.
- Small Grants for community and civil society organizations.
- CHT Development Facility to be established.
- Establish library/e-library and other

- to the committees.
- PDC members and community people are using the MCC for different social function e.g. weeding ceremony, meetings etc.
- Signed 'Sports for Peace Contract' agreement with CHT Regional Council.
   First instalment disbursed to CHTRC.
- Organized Football tournament for all communities in the CHT.
- Organized 40 exposure visits for communities, PDC members and local elected and traditional leaders across the CHT.
- Organized two large cultural festivals in Dhaka in 2007 and 2008 and in the CHT several smaller ones.
- Facilitated approximately 20 events to promote CHT culture.
- Provide financial and technical support to different Civil Society Organizations to promote. Indigenous culture and their rights
- Facilitated observation at local level numerous awareness raising international days.

- resources.
- Purchase books, journals, DVDs, recordings and other resources for the library.
- English Language training for students from vulnerable groups.
- CHT public awards to recognize contributions to confidence building and development in the CHT.
- Sports for Peace programme organized in three Hill Districts.
- An assessment of the situation of IDPs, ex combatants and India returned refugees.
- Funds to be provided to IDP Task Force to support rehabilitation of IDPs and ex-combatants and India Returned Refugees.

## Government of the People's Republic of Bangladesh Ministry of Chittagong Hill Tracts Affairs Bangladesh Secretariat, Dhaka.

# Minutes of the Meeting of the National Steering Committee on "Promotion of Development and Confidence Building in the Chittagong Hill Tracts"

## held on August 19th, 2008

The third National Steering Committee (NSC) meeting of the Joint GoB/UNDP Programme on "Promotion of Development and Confidence building in the Chittagong Hill Tracts" was held on August 19th, 2008 at the conference room "Surma", of the Sonargaon Hotel. The meeting was chaired by the Honourable Special Assistant to the Chief Advisor and in charge, Ministry of Chittagong Hill Tracts Affairs (MoCHTA), Raja Devasish Roy. The meeting was attended by Mr. Shaikh Altaf Ali, Secretary of MoCHTA, Resident Coordinator of UNDP, Ms Renata Lok Dessallien, representatives of various ministries and CHT institutions, and development partners (see Annexe-1 for complete participants list).

The agenda of the National Steering Committee Meeting included presentations by the CHTDF Project Director, Mr. Patrick Sweeting and key project staff (see Annexe-2 for detailed agenda).

The Meeting commenced by a welcome note delivered by the Honourable Special Assistant to the Chief Advisor and in charge, Ministry of Chittagong Hill Tracts Affairs(MoCHTA), Raja Devasish Roy. The participants introduced themselves soon after the welcome note.

The Introduction session was followed by a brief speech made by the Resident Coordinator of UNDP, Ms Renata Lok Dessallen and by the Secretary of MoCHTA, Mr. Shaikh Altaf Ali.

This was followed by a presentation by the Chief of Policies & Confidence Building ChTDF, Mr. Prasenjit Chakma. Mr. Chakma presented UNDP-CHTDF responses to the Inter-ministerial committee report that was jointly prepared by MoCHTA and other concerned ministries as a follow—up to the last NSC meeting held on August 19, 2007( see Annexe-3 for presentation hand out). During the presentation, The Honourable Special Assistant asked Mr. Chakma to clarify the current status of the establishment of administrative units in CHTRC and HDCs under QIF to provide financial assistance to the HDCs to implement QIF projects, The Honourable Special Assistant then askled the representatives from the HDCs present at the meeting to follow-up on this issue.

Mr. Chakma's presentation was followed by the 2<sup>nd</sup> presentation of the day by the Chief of Implementation, Mr. Robert Stoelman. Mr. Stoleman presented the updates and highlights of the project implementation status in front of the committee (see Annexe-4 for presentation hand out). During the presentation, the Honourable Special Assistant asked Mr. Stoelman to explain whose organogram the presentation was referring that would be reviewed during this year. Mr. Stoelman clarified that the organograms referred to the HDCs and the CHTRC.

The Honourable Secretary of MoCHTA also opined that representatives from Ministry of Health and Familly Welfare (MoHFW) needed to be present at this meeting to contribute to the discussion related to the expansion of the health programme in the CHT. He also inquired whether the concerned ministry was consulted during the formulation of the Health Plan. As Mr. Stoelman and Mr. Chakma confirmed, the MoHFW was involved during the first health mission that was conducted in the past. Furthermore,

Page 1 of 5



McHFW officals have recently visited the health programme in the CHT. The Tribal Health Plan was also formulated by the McHFW under the greater national Health, Nutrition and Population Plan for Sector Program (HNPSP) and they have formed an implementation committee in which Mr. Prosenjil Chakma is a member. The Honourable Special Assistant requested a meeting to be held jointly organised by McHFW and McCHTA that should also be attended by UNDP and local government units. A similar meeting should also be organised with the Ministry of Primary and Mass Education (McPMED) as well. It was also noted by Joint Secretary (Dev) that representatives from the Primary and Mass Education instead of Ministry of Education should be co-opted in the NSC as the project deals with pre-school and primary education only.

The Honourable Special Assistant also informed the participants that he has been discussing possible changes in Primary Education Policies especially on the issues of accessibility, mother tongue, teacher appointment, teacher-student ratio, school registration, land registration etc. with both the Primary and Mass Education Advisor and DG. The Honourable Special Assistant promised to keep the participants informed on further updates in this matter.

Mr. Stoelman's presentation was followed by the third presentation mady by Mr. Lushantha Arsecularatne mapping out the financial position of the project.

The last presentation of the meeting was done by Mr. Patrick Sweeting that discussed the forward looking strategies and future project extension.

The presentations were followed by an open discussion session. The floor was opened to the participants for discussion and this session was facilitated by the Honourable Special Assistant.

Mr. Nazimudding Chowdhury, Member (Admn.) of CHTDB opined that UNDP should implement the project through HDCs and RC.

Mr. Fabrizio Senesi, Programme Manager for Governance and Human Right, Delegation of the European Commission to Bangladesh stated that Confidence Building in CHT is linked quite intimately with political issues and suggested to examine areas for reinforcing cooperation. He also suggested including the donors into the steering committee and to hold more frequent meetings of the NSC. He expressed EC's firm commitment to fund the project until 2013.

Mr. Ratan K Majumder, Conservator of Forest suggested that Forest Department should be involved in any development activities inside the reserved forests as this could otherwise be detrimental to the environment and ecology.

Mr. Robert Beadle, Director of CIDA and High Commissioner of Canda a. i. thanked all concerned for the comprehensive presentations which he felt would be very useful for the donors. He said CIDA is very favourably disposed to extend the project.

Mrs. Rawshan Ara Begum, Joint Secretary (Admn.) MoCHTA highlighted the importance of the project for overall development and confidence building in the CHT. She opined that all aspects of development and peace in the CHT have been covered by the project. She emphasised on more involvement of GoB at every stage and at all levels during project implementation; such GoB involvement should continue during the extension period of the project.

Page 2 of 5

W



Mr. Shaikh Altaf Ali, Secretary of MoCHTA thanked project personnel for the presentations. He opined that some changes might be needed during the implementation of the project. However, he stated that the Ministry should be kept informed of the changes. All major changes need to be placed before the Steering Committee and cleared by it. He made it clear that the NSC is the apex body of the project. However, some changes might be brought to the notice of Planning Commission as appropriate. MoCHTA, once aware of the changes, can examine those and act appropriately.

He said a comparative analysis of the project would be very useful which will show where we are now and where we should be in future. He opined that some sort of evaluation of the impact of the project is needed to justify the project extension. The Secretary of MoCHTA then thanked the development partners for supporting extension of the project.

The Secretary of MoCHTA then expressed his view that the Ministry and NSC members could accept in principle the extension of the project, so that the technical formalities can be started. If all the members agreed on this, then they could state that in principle the National Steering Committee agrees to the extension. The final approval is subject to the impact assessment study and full justification of expansion of the project.

Honourable Special Assistant took the floor and stated that in his opinion the HDC, RC or MoCHTA were not ready yet to take over this project without UNDP-CHTDF. This further justifies the need to extend the project for another 4 years. He also thanked the donor community for providing continued support for the project.

He went on to clarify that procedures that have already been approved in the project Document do not need approval from NSC or MoCHTA. He encouraged both UNDP and government counterparts to " talk in the same language". He said so far there have been positive interactions between UNDP and the ministries and he finally believed that most issues could be resolved between the concerned parties across the table.

The Honourable Special Assistant also emphasized the need to start dialogue on some of the other important issues in the CHT issues such as, "what will be the role of the taskforce on IDPs?", training for police to sensitize them to the unique CHT situation, elections for HDC and CHTRC, etc.

The Honourable Special Assistant's comments were followed by comments from the UN Resident Coordinator, Renata Lok Dessallien. She highlighted that there have been significant achievements in the CHT and within UNDP-CHTDF but there have also been gaps since the inception of the project. However, keeping aside the finer details of the project the broader goal and future direction for the project is to consolidate peace in the CHT. The essence of it is in recognition and acceptance of different identities, coexistence of them and sharing of scarce resources. Given these constraints, we strive to attain peace in the CHT region. She urged everyone to remember that big changes and lasting peace require sustained efforts by all concerned.

She presented the following rationale for project extension: initially the UNDP project was the outcome of the peace accord after long disturbance, unrest and conflict in the CHT. But now it is time to focus on how development can serve as a preventive measure to tackle such undesirable incidents. In

Page 3 of 5

gh



addition to being a presence on the ground, she asked, are there other proactive measures UNDP can undertake? Sustainability of present components and talking off those that have not been implemented yet are also good grounds for extension. She also raised the question of how UNDP can help assist other indigenous groups in Bangladesh. She expressed interest in working with the GoB to help other indigenous groups. She thanked MoCHTA, the sectoral ministries; CHTRC and HDCs for their constant support, and also thanked the development partners.

The Honourable Special Assistant followed on Ms.Dessallien's tast point by mentioning that possible interventions for Adibasis on the plains should be formulated on a pilot project basis. These can be developed from small windows within the UNDP-CHTDF project and go on to become separate projects for the indigenous people in the plain districts.

The Honourable Special Assistant extended his full support to this end. He also urged concerned GoB and UNDP-CHTDF to consider collaboration with the Special Affairs Division to raise its capacity to make it more participatory and inclusive of adivasis in the plains.

## Finally, the following decisions were made in the 3<sup>rd</sup> National Steering Committee Meeting:

- The NSC meeting should be held at least twice a year.
- The present interactions and sharing of information among government and project officials should continue further.
- MoCHTA will coordinate with all relevant GoB ministries/ organisations in getting their clearance, support and cooperation for CHTDF activities.
- MoCHTA will organize an Inter-ministerial meeting with the Ministry of Health and Family Welfare (MHFW) to get its support in implementation of the Health Component of the Promotion of Development and Confidence Building in the CHT Project.
- MoCHTA will organize an inter-ministerial meeting with the Ministry of Primary and Mass Education (MoPMED) to get its support in implementation of the Basic Education Component of the Promotion of Development and Confidence Building in the CHT Project.
- A representative of the Ministry of Primary & Mass Education (MoPMED) will be co-opted into the NSC.
- 7. Study tours to see successful examples of indigenous peoples' development, post-conflict rehabilitation, confidence and peace building, decentralised and autonomous governance systems, etc in various countries of the world have been found to be very successful in building the capacities and widening the visions and understandings of the government officials, local leaders and other stakeholders; such study tours should take place more frequently.
- The Promotion of Development and Confidence Building in the CHT Project may enter into Letter of Agreement (LoA) or Memorandum of Understanding (MoU) with any organisation for the purpose of smooth implementation of its project activities.
- The project should explore, with full GoB involvement, the ways and means of environmental
  conservation and optimal and sustainable utilization of the natural resources of CHT region,
  including those in the reserve forests and seek to improve the livelihoods of the people,
  especially the IDPs, living therein

Page 4 of 5

do

Oria

- 10. If the project wants to increase its total project expenditure, proper guidelines will be followed accordingly.
- 11. With a view to facilitate actual programmes and project for the indigenous peoples (Adivasis) of the plain districts by governmental agencies, including the Special Affairs Division, and by UNDP and/or other UN agencies in separate projects, a small pilot initiative may be considered under this project to identify the development needs of the Adivasis of the plains districts if resources are available .
- 12. The Promotion of Development and Confidence Building in the CHT Project, which is scheduled to end September 2009, should be extended until December 2013 under same implementation modalities. The extension will have an estimated budget of \$75 million, and will have to be cleared by ECNEC. All preparatory activities for the extension should start immediately.

The meeting ended with a vote of thanks from the Chair.

Sd/-

(Raia Devasish Roy)

Chairperson

National Steering Committee Promotion of Development and Confidence Building in the CHT\*

Special Assistant to the Chief Advisor Ministry of Chittagong Hill Tracts Affairs.

No. MoCHTA (Dev)-152/2007/426

Date: 12 October, 2008

## Copy forwarded for information and necessary action to:

- Chairman, Chittagong Hill Tracts Regional Council, Rangamati.
- Secretary, Chief Advisor's Office, Old Sangsad Bhaban, Tejgaon, Dhaka.
- Secretary, Ministry of Home Affairs, Bangladesh Secretariat, Dhaka.
- Secretary, Ministry of Health & Family Welfare, Bangladesh Secretariat, Dhaka
- Secretary, Ministry of Education, Bangladesh Secretariat, Dhaka.
- 6. Secretary, Ministry of Primary & Mass Education, Bangladesh Secretariat, Dhaka.
- Secretary, Planning Division, Sher-e-Bangla Nagar, Dhaka.
- 8. Secretary, Economic Relation Division, Sher-e-Bangla Nagar, Dhaka.
- Resident Representative, UNDP, IDB Bhaban, Agargaon, Dhaka.
- 10. Chairman, Chittagong Hill Tracts Development Board, Rangamati.
- Divisional Commissioner, Chittagong Division.
- 12. Chairman, Hill District Council, Khagrachari/Rangamati/Bandarban.
- 12. Project Director, UNDP-CHTDF, IDB Bhaban, Agargaon, Dhaka.
- Conservator of Forests, Rangamati Circle, Rangamati.
- Circle Chief, Mong Circle, Khagrachari/Bornong Circle, Bandarban,/Chakma Circle, Rangamati.
- 16. Deputy Chief, Ministry of Chittagong Hill Tracts Affairs, Bangladesh Secretariat, Dhaka.

Assistant Secretary (Dev.)

Page 5 of 5

